

REDD Research and Development Center of Forestry and Forest Products Research Institute

The Second Open Seminar for 2011

Report on “Toward developing a framework of global REDD+ –  
Scaling up of demonstration activities and integrating players’ roles –”

**Summary of the seminar**

The second open seminar organized by REDD Research and Development Center of Forestry and Forest Products Research Institute was held on the 7th and 8th of February, 2012. Although it unfortunately rained over these two days, the open seminar drew many diverse stakeholders, including private companies, research agencies, universities, administrative authorities, and NGOs, besides government officials. They delivered very informative presentations and were involved in significant discussions.

**Aims of the seminar**

As a response to the report issued by the Intergovernmental Panel on Climate Change (IPCC) that greenhouse gases derived from deforestation account for about 20% of the world’s total greenhouse gas emissions, REDD+ has attracted attention as an effective countermeasure. The Japanese government proposed the “Bilateral Offset Credit Mechanism” by which Japan provides low-carbon technologies and products to developing countries and has the reduction achieved in these developing countries approved as Japan’s reduction through bilateral agreements. The Forestry and Forest Products Research Institute (FFPRI) wishes to promote these activities by working on the framework of REDD+.

As the voluntary approach of the private sector progresses in parallel with intergovernmental negotiations, there is a need to solve technological problems through experiences in the field in order to create a practical framework of REDD+ and promote

sustainable forest management. In addition, implementation of REDD+ needs to involve a wide range of players including governments, administrative authorities, international agencies, research agencies, private companies, NGOs, and local residents. This seminar is designed to let attendees share the knowledge and experience that they have obtained and the difficulties that they have encountered in their practical activities, and to explore methods to solve these difficulties.

FFPRI’s president, Dr. Kazuo Suzuki, and deputy director general of the Forestry Agency, Mr. Masatoshi Numata, delivered their opening addresses with the hope that this seminar will promote and strengthen the alliance between all people concerned with the progress of REDD+.

**Opening session**

The director of the REDD Research and Development Center, Dr. Mitsuo Matsumoto, presented a lecture on a theme that is now particularly relevant for REDD+ titled, “What is the role of each player involved in REDD+?”

In COP17, held in Durban, South Africa, last December, an agreement was reached on the roadmap to decide the particulars of the framework to be participated in by all members by 2015 at the latest, so that the framework can be put into practice in 2020. It was a big step forward in the response to climate change. Dr. Matsumoto, however, insisted the importance of promoting and supporting voluntary projects, saying “We need to address deforestation as soon as possible because delaying the initiation until

2020 means that deforestation will continue to progress in the meantime.”

COP17 achieved robust results including an agreement on the guidelines for a system to provide information on safeguards and the modality for determining the reference level in REDD+. On the other hand, it faces a problem in terms of how to scale up the level of ongoing voluntary projects worldwide to the national level. This is a problem shared by all the countries involved, and it is desirable to explore possible solutions by exchanging information between these countries.

Director Dr. Matsumoto stated that we should focus the discussion on how we should share deforestation management through REDD+ instead of merely pursuing REDD+ as the goal.

### **Session 1: Policies and needs of developing countries and a consistent approach**

In session 1, representatives from 10 countries made presentations under the theme of exploring a highly receptive approach consistent with the policies and needs of developing countries.

First, Mr. Constin Bigol from Papua New Guinea made a presentation. In his country, 1.41% of forested land is deforested or degraded annually. His country has been working on a review of its forest plan (introduction of the REDD initiative) for 19 provinces, reorganization of the Forest Authority (establishment of the division handling climate change), formulation of an action plan to implement the REDD initiative, selection of a REDD+ pilot site, and selection of REDD+ activities since 2007. However, in this country, it is difficult to conduct field surveys because of poor infrastructure, so a pilot project of remote sensing is being undertaken with grant assistance from the Japan International Cooperation Agency (JICA) using the data available from the RapidEye Satellite and the Phased Array type L-band Synthetic Aperture Radar (PALSAR), and addressing the research and

development of the Canopy Volume Estimation approach, which estimates tree height and stem volume by combining the three-dimensional terrain data and the three-dimensional canopy data available from the Geographic Synthetic Aperture Radar (GeoSAR). Papua New Guinea is scheduled to construct a new database of national forest management based on these data by 2014. Mr. Bigol mentioned that the activities to prepare for REDD+ contribute greatly to the capability development of his country to foster sustainable forest management.

Following Mr. Constin Bigol, Mr. Sairusi Bulai from the Secretariat of the Pacific Community delivered a presentation on the framework of regional support for REDD readiness activities. The Secretariat of the Pacific Community is a regional cooperation organization consisting mainly of 22 island countries in the South Pacific, and each member country is currently conducting a pilot project of REDD+. In this region, local communities own most forests and land, except in Tonga where the royal family owns most of the land. This fact is of great help to the success of the REDD project because it is easy to ask a community to participate in the project. However, a system involving unwritten community ownership is associated with a lot of unregistered land, which is a problem for carrying out this project. It is, therefore, necessary to set up a scheme that allows small landowners to enjoy the benefits of this project.

For this purpose, the Secretariat of the Pacific Community is constructing a regional policy framework, which stipulates the strategy to combat drivers (causes) of deforestation and its leakage (spread to unprotected areas), measuring, reporting and verification (MRV), and reference levels, and regional guidelines for monitoring methods to implement safeguards, cooperation, coordination, information exchange, and capacity-building within the region. The regional policy framework is intended to share and improve expertise and technology within the region,

improve the existing agencies that provide training and technology services related to MRV, and strengthen the ability for international participation. Mr. Bulai mentioned that he hoped the regional policy framework will become an umbrella under which REDD+ is implemented, and which will lead the way in the desired direction.

Mr. Samsudin Musa from Malaysia reported on a new project that would start in February 2012 with the support of the International Tropical Timber Organization (ITTO) as part of a phased approach to implement REDD+. Because forests are mostly owned by the provinces in Malaysia, their participation in REDD+ is indispensable and the benefits that each province can obtain from REDD+ need to be clearly depicted. For this purpose, this project adopts a sub-national approach that has never been undertaken in previous projects. To be specific, Malaysia will develop guidelines and monitoring tools to evaluate forest degradation and establish a method to evaluate and reduce forest degradation in a forest management unit (FMU) that combines remote sensing and surface study. In addition, it will set up a framework to enable cost-benefit analysis of forest conservation to be undertaken and payments to be made under REDD or the Payments for Ecosystem Services (PES). On top of that, it will develop an enlightenment program for policymakers and forest managers, cultivate their abilities necessary for REDD+ and carbon accounting, and promote the exchange of knowledge between REDD projects within the region.

Mr. Musa insisted that the success of REDD+ depends on the transaction costs and carbon price. Unless the benefits obtained by forest conservation are presented in specific values, it will be hard to convince provincial governments to participate in the project. Moreover, a complicated mechanism increases the transaction costs and reduces the motivation to implement REDD+. He indicated that the compatibility between environmental integrity and practicality is the

most important issue.

Following Mr. Samsudin Musa, Mr. Yuyu Rahayu from Indonesia reported on the development status of the MRV system in his country. In the G20 meeting in 2009, President Susilo Bambang Yudhoyono declared that his country would reduce emissions by 26% through independent efforts by 2020 and realize an additional reduction of 15% through international cooperation. At the same time, he officially promised to promote the compatibility between effective utilization of natural resources and 7% economic growth by implementing REDD+. To realize this political promise, Indonesia has already completed more than 20 kinds of land-cover classification maps that cover the entire country's area. These maps were produced by remote sensing using Landsat satellite images, and data of these maps are used to categorize forests. Forest cover and deforestation are monitored every three years in the country. Indonesia is also conducting a survey on peatlands that emit a large amount of carbon and accumulating data on these emissions.

These data are included in the national forest inventory and used for the estimation of forest timber volume, biomass, and carbon emissions. Indonesia plans to upgrade the national forest inventory to include the reference emission level and the reference level in the future. However, the number of forest categories should be increased to about 600 to improve the accuracy of estimated figures, as Indonesia has 200–300 forest categories at present because of fund shortages. Lastly, Mr. Rahayu indicated that establishing the MRV system is vital to make REDD+ practical and enhance the understanding of the system on a sub-national level, such as the local government level and the regional level.

Mr. Omaliss Keo from Cambodia reported on an approach to connect REDD+ with existing policy and strategy. Because his country has several existing policies and programs to tackle climate change, including the millennium development goal to increase

and improve the forest cover to 60% and the National Forest Program, consistency with the existing framework is vital to implement REDD+. Above all, the National Forest Programme is closely related to REDD+. After forest demarcation is confirmed, classified, and registered, Cambodia will address the conservation and development of forest resources and biodiversity, enforcement and governance of forest law, and implementation of community forestry. In addition, Cambodia is trying to realize sustainable financing by introducing REDD, PES, and environment protection rights, although it is currently conducting forest management with public funding.

Mr. Keo emphasized the necessity of political support through the development of the legal system to implement REDD+. Because Cambodia has a lot of forest with overlapping ownership rights and unclear customary ownership, the ownership of timber and carbon in the forest should be clarified. On top of that, he indicated the necessity of securing consistency in the registration of REDD+ to prevent duplicate registration and establishment of a methodology of fund management and profit-sharing as future issues.

Next, Mr. Khamsene Ounekham from Laos delivered a presentation. Laos has been addressing REDD+ from three perspectives: approach by national agencies, mitigation activities at the national level, and projects at the sub-national level. For the harmonious progress of these three approaches, Laos adopted a nested approach that integrates activities at the provincial and project levels into those at the national level in addition to developing the legal system and public funding under the initiative of the government. Mr. Ounekham introduced the Forest Information Management (FIM) program supported by JICA. In this program, Laos will draw a forest base map for 2010, conduct a field survey of the entire country, introduce remote sensing, construct a database, and build capacity for future field surveys. The results of these activities will improve the classification system of

the national forest inventory. Currently, maps of forest cover are being drawn for 2000, 2006, and 2011 in the FIM to formulate the reference level and reference emission level. On the basis of these forest cover maps, the country is trying to calculate its carbon accumulation by converting the FIM's biomass data into data at the national level and incorporating change in forest cover between 2000 and 2011 into the reference emission level on the national level. In addition, for the construction of the nation's MRV system, it is stratifying the forest cover map on the carbon map using the data of the RIM and REDD+ and planning to track changes of forest cover over the entire country through satellite monitoring every one or two years.

Mr. Noriyoshi Kitamura from JICA made a presentation on the current status of REDD+ in Vietnam. Vietnam seems to have shown recovery of forests throughout the country, but deforestation and forest degradation are serious in some specific areas. The Vietnamese government is addressing measures for climate change actively, and it has established some platforms to implement REDD+ in the country. For example, Vietnam has its own system of forest protection agreement, while specification of who owns land is underway in Vietnam. This system involves agreements being made with people living around forests that they will not cut down trees and oversee illegal logging, and pays a certain amount of money to them as a fee for playing a certain role in forest conservation. The pilot project of the Payment for Forest Environmental Services (PFES) has been in progress since 2009. This system pays cash to forest owners and system contractors depending on the level of conservation of the forest, and it is scheduled to be implemented nationwide in 2012. This approach is supposed to be based on the financing mechanism of REDD+.

Mr. Joaquim Macuacua from Mozambique introduced the formulation of the framework to

implement REDD+ in his country, which is to be conducted with technical cooperation from JICA. Mozambique conducted its first national forest inventory in 1980 with financial aid from the Food and Agriculture Organization (FAO). The national forest inventory was revised in 1994 and 2007, and the country is now conducting forest inventories even on the provincial level. Mr. Macuacua stated that Mozambique had been trying to construct a monitoring system with support from the Japanese government as a preparatory activity for REDD+, but it had encountered numerous problems. To overcome the current stalemate, the country plans to construct a platform of sustainable forest resource information for monitoring using JICA's technology support, starting in 2012. In this plan, it will collect data from various agencies, as well as a satellite image map of the entire country and all possible information on forest and geography. It will also carry out a pilot project to construct a land-use map and forest cover map through remote sensing that use images of Synthetic Aperture Radar (SAR) and data of field tests in two provinces. The capacity for the pilot project will be developed simultaneously. At the same time, it will construct a ground monitoring system and put it into operation, and deforestation and forest degradation will be detected and reported using the global positioning system (GPS) and geographical information system (GIS) technologies. Through these activities, it will set up the reference level and organize a set of data for the estimation of biomass and carbon amounts.

Mr. Patrik Onotamba Kondjo from the Republic of Congo reported on the national forest survey system of his country. Congo is trying to construct a system for MRV for purposes at two levels: nationally and internationally. The objectives at the national level are to evaluate the effectiveness of the national policy, monitor illegal logging, and conduct specific verification of the means to prevent illegal logging. At the international level, the objectives are to obtain trust

by showing cases of successful conservation in Congo to the international society, stimulate investment in Congo, and publish the country's official statistics for international agencies. Mr. Kondjo indicated the importance of learning from the development of capacity building and methodology under the initiative of South-South Cooperation, saying that his country needs to learn from the approach of other developing countries. Congo is constructing the "Terra Congo" system to estimate the levels of carbon and status of emissions with reference to the forest management system of Brazil. Mr. Kondjo also introduced the "Terra Congo" system using a demonstration.

Lastly, Ms. Lidia Perez from Paraguay gave a presentation on the development of REDD+ strategy in her country and the policy and institutional framework of the study on the estimation of carbon accumulation. The deforestation in Paraguay is attributed to the increased demand for pastures due to the skyrocketing prices of beans and beef, excessive deforestation for charcoal production, and forest fires. She also mentioned the difficulties resulting for inconsistencies between environmental law and forest law and the lack of economic incentives for forest management. Her country is conducting a national joint program under the initiative of the UN-REDD program. This is intended to incorporate the requirements of REDD+ into the design of the domestic system and budget and to implement REDD+ in a timely manner by building capacity. To be specific, the institutional and technological ability of the government and civil society required for the activities of REDD+ will be developed. This will be followed by building capacity to practice REDD+ at the regional level and providing knowledge and technology on REDD+ to communities dependent on forests, including those of indigenous people. Constructing an MRV system requires improvement of the forest information system, forest inventory, environmental information system, and carbon accounting system. In addition, Paraguay is

extending many of its activities, including monitoring and prevention of forest fires, improvement and review of laws and regulations, conservation of biodiversity, and biomass estimates, with the support of various international agencies like the Forestry and Forest Products Research Institute (FFPRI) and the UN-REDD program.

### **Session 1: Questions and answers and summary**

The attendees asked various questions on the reports delivered by the presenters. In particular, many attendees asked about the methodology of remote sensing and monitoring and they wanted to know the specific details of these approaches. In particular, they were very interested in the costs and benefits of implementing REDD+ and the idea of safeguards. Mr. Musa from Malaysia was asked about the appropriate level of compensation, given the fact that no one wishes to participate in REDD+ without sufficient incentives because it is a voluntary program. Responding to this question, Mr. Musa stated that he wished to explore the specific financial incentives of the current project, although he was not able to give any specific financial incentives at present. Mr. Ounekham from Laos was asked a question about the specific details of in Laos. He presented ideas such as creating information material in the languages of the different ethnic groups within the country and distributing them locally because activities to provide accurate knowledge and educate people on the environment can stimulate voluntary participation among communities as a grassroots campaign.

No definitive answers were given to resolve the two issues of incentives of REDD+ and safeguards, and the respondents mostly stated that they wished to find answers through ongoing approaches. Their attitudes clearly show that each country and each agency is trying to find appropriate answers taking into full consideration the lives of residents who are dependent on forest resources, despite the fact that these two issues cannot be resolved immediately.

Lastly, the center director, Dr. Matsumoto, delivered comprehensive comments. In last year's international seminar held in the same period, presentations from participating countries did not go beyond how to construct an MRV system. In this year's international seminar, presentations commonly dealt with how to construct a national database system, utilize such systems for REDD+ and forest conservation, and use them in a legal context. As his conclusion of the first day, Dr. Matsumoto expressed his astonishment and impression that each country had made greater progress than anticipated, extended his gratitude to the presenters, and asked for continuing efforts in the future.

### **Session 2: How should REDD+ demonstration activities be implemented and scaled up?**

#### **(1) The approach for scaling up**

On the second day of the seminar, each agency delivered a presentation mainly on REDD+ and technology development involved in REDD+, and a panel discussion was conducted.

The session began with presentations from organizations promoting international activities. Ms. Naomi Swickard of the secretariat of Verified Carbon Standard (VCS) introduced the credit system for REDD+. VCS is the certification organization addressing the development of an offset project in the voluntary carbon market. Ms. Swickard pointed out the necessity of drawing a common blueprint and implementing measures to tackle deforestation as soon as possible because a major factor preventing widespread dissemination of REDD+ is the coexistence of various international systems and rules. Among the available measures, the nested approach seems to be the most effective for fundraising because it attracts wide attention from the private sector. In addition, it can reduce risk and provide services to multiple markets. However, it is necessary to solve problems related to vested rights and upgrade the

baseline of the project activities regularly in order to put the nesting system into practical use. At the same time, it is also necessary to maintain consistency between the systems to prevent them from overlapping. Ms. Swickard said, “It is necessary to secure the consistency of the market and system besides the possibility of distribution of the system beyond the national and regional levels.”

Next, Dr. Matsumoto from the REDD Research and Development Center of FFPRI introduced the development of the guidelines of REDD+. Currently, governments and private companies are extending voluntary activities despite the fact that the framework of REDD+ has not been specified clearly, but efficiency and cooperation between various stakeholders are indispensable to realize REDD+. In this sense, the REDD Research and Development Center is developing guidelines that promote efficiency and cooperation. The guidelines take into consideration the Bilateral Offset Credit Mechanism, which is particularly attractive to Japan. The REDD Research and Development Center also aims to develop an operational framework in accordance with the decision of the United Nations Framework Convention on Climate Change (UNFCCC) in response to the success of VCS and reflecting the Afforestation/Restoration Clean Development Mechanism (AR-CDM). At the same time, it is necessary to consider readiness activities because the activities that have been conducted voluntarily need to continue for a long period. To be specific, it was decided as a policy to include such factors as compatibility of land, conservation of biodiversity, and consideration for indigenous people, as well as to conduct interviews with authorities concerned with improving the draft. Dr. Matsumoto talked about the future prospects, saying, “We hope that the guidelines will contribute to promoting REDD+ and establishing a global framework after the Second Commitment of the Kyoto Protocol.”

Next, Mr. Jonah Busch from Conservation International reported on the construction of a reference level across multiple scales. Under the UNFCCC’s rule, reduction of carbon emissions of forest is recognized in terms of total emissions at the national level, but decisions leading to deforestation are mostly made at the sub-national level. Therefore, it is necessary to construct economic incentives to allow actors to promote emission reduction beyond the national and sub-national levels. If incentives are not well organized, the balance of payment of REDD may fall into the red. However, several measures are available for this, including incorporating accounting, setting more accurate values with the help of the reference level at the sub-national level, dividing earnings, and sharing responsibility. He introduced a case in which impacts on deforestation, reduction of emissions, and profit that vary depending on the government were calculated and mapped using Open Source Impacts of REDD Incentives Spreadsheet (OSIRIS) that Conservation International developed for Indonesia. He also introduced the case study of Peru to confirm that the design of an incentive system substantially affects the effectiveness of REDD+.

Dr. Sarah Walker was invited from the ECO team of Winrock International, which is an NGO that works on extending technical aid for the sustainable utilization of natural resources in developing countries. She introduced the roles of local actors to create the reference emission level and MRV data. She indicated that asking local actors to get involved in the creation of activity data and emission coefficients will change their attitudes to the carbon emission issue dramatically, and in particular, they can be of great help in sampling measurements in the field. She also introduced the Moabi project that the World Wildlife Fund (WWF) is conducting using smartphones and the Plan Vivo project. Furthermore, she mentioned that she is working on a monitoring program with resident participation in the LEAF project designed for five

Southeast Asian countries and exploring what roles a local community can play in the REDD strategy.

In the question and answer session, Ms. Swickard introduced a recent approach in Thailand as an example of connecting various systems. In this case, the project members try to promote their activities by introducing the VCS original tag system, which numbers projects and units awarded additional certifications for the Voluntary Carbon Units (VCU) of Thailand.

As an example of a performance-based project, the PES project implemented by Winrock International in Vietnam was introduced. In this case, forest conservation activities are recommended to farmers, and farmers can get compensation in accordance with their results. This shows a resolution not to make the same mistake again because the project previously failed to pay farmers despite the fact that it had promised to do so to the regional community. Responding to a question about the selection of the country and region for a project, Dr. Walker recommended selecting places where scientists have developed spatial modeling methods using GIS because there are various data available for such locations.

Responding to a question about what will happen in the period when the UNFCCC's REDD system is not operational, Mr. Busch mentioned that discussions between different countries and different divisions are desirable. Indonesia is gradually scaling up the system used in Central Kalimantan to the national level in conformity with a bilateral agreement with Norway. He hoped that the knowledge obtained through the project would be helpful to the inter-department discussions that have not yet been initiated in Indonesia.

Dr. Walker stated that the government would need to sort out data and methods in order to secure the quality of data. In addition, she indicated the possibility that, even if a good method is developed to measure deforestation in the future, there will still be a problem on how to relate the measurement to previously

obtained data, which would not be equivalent. One of the attendees gave a response to the presentation delivered by Mr. Busch, saying that the method to measure carbon emissions only through deforestation is not defect-free. Mr. Busch replied that he is currently focusing only on deforestation because carbon emissions are more closely related to deforestation than any other factors.

## **(2) Implementation in the field and technology to support the implementation**

Presentations were delivered on approaches in the field and technology. Mr. Evarist Nashanda introduced the preparatory situation of the Tanzanian government for REDD+. Over the past 20 years, the Tanzanian government has been addressing the issue of deforestation, and it found that community-based forest management and management in forest reserves are necessary. During the five-year preparatory period, it concluded a prospectus on climate change and forest conservation, introduced an MRV system, collected funds, and established a national management committee and a technology committee on climate change. Currently, the government and the private sector are working together, focusing on the three steps of REDD+. Because producing a land-use plan is a very important project in Tanzania, a survey is being conducted with reference to social and economic baselines, and efforts are being made to establish an MRV system. On the other hand, the Tanzanian government faces various problems. Mr. Nashanda pointed out that people hoping to receive income from REDD started to feel disappointed because its enforcement seemed to remain a long way off in the future. At the same time, the government has been asked to identify serious and concrete approaches that avoid leaving unsettled problems for the future, since poor people live off activities that adversely affect REDD+.

Next, Mr. Kei Suzuki from the Japan Forest Technology Association made a presentation based on



his experience in the development of a reference emission level and a reference level in Vietnam, in which he has been involved. In Vietnam, forest is classified by visual judgment using satellite images. By resolving several issues, Suzuki completed the forest classification map and calculated the forest area. He also organized a huge amount of previously obtained data and calculated the emission coefficient. When he formulated a method of calculating carbon changes using two kinds of data, he came across a problem of whether emission and absorption should be summated or each value should be aggregated on a countrywide level. He introduced the stock change method, which performs the calculation by summating emission and absorption, and the forest change matrix method, which separates emission and absorption in the calculation. He showed the merits and demerits of the aggregation at a national level and a regional scale. Even UNFCCC has not reached a conclusion on which of the two is better, and discussions on this issue are underway. The above approach made it clear that a statistical background is necessary for the design of remote sensing, technology for forest classification, and survey points.

Mr. Yoshiyuki Kiyono from FFPRI described knowledge that he had obtained through research and development of a forest monitoring method. Traditionally, the major drivers of deforestation are food production and production of industrial raw materials. To explore measures for these two drivers, REDD Research and Development Center has been conducting research in Cambodia, Malaysia, and Paraguay, where the conversion of forest to farmland and rubber plantations is in progress. Although most developing countries do not monitor the forest carbon accumulation at the national level, it is possible to monitor forest carbon accumulation using satellite remote sensing if permanent sample plots (PSPs) are set in an extended area. In Cambodia, it was proved that repeated calculations of multiplying forest area by

the average carbon accumulation per area can show the national trend in forest carbon accumulation. Because the number of PSPs required for the calculation of the average carbon accumulation has already been estimated, Cambodia is constructing an allometry formula (allometry equation) to estimate biomass amount from such simple data as the diameter of trees in deciduous forests and peaty marsh forests. However, establishing automatic classification of remote sensing and a precise and simple method for surface study has been left as future technological issues.

Responding to the above presentation, attendees discussed the required number of PSPs, including aspects such as reliability and efficiency. In addition, researchers and developers expressed their desire to receive opinions and knowledge from users on the method of publishing remote sensing data. Furthermore, it was reported that, because coniferous trees do not exhibit seasonality, efforts are being made to learn by trial and error using normalized difference vegetation index (NDVI) with the help of data from Landsat. Asked if the community-based organization for forest management and joint forest management will be utilized as the implementing agency, we were told that participatory forest management had already been used as the platform for REDD+ and each community had already been involved in the management.

### **Session 3: What goals should be reached through REDD+? Beyond REDD+**

In this session, attendees reported and had discussions on the future prospects for sustainable forest management, taking the progress so far into consideration. Mr. Hwan Ok Ma from ITTO made a presentation on the summary and history of REDD+ and the international approach for REDD. In REDD+, it is desired to promote conservation of the Amazon rainforest from the point of view of conserving biodiversity. In Tanzania, the approach for sustainable forest management is advancing, and the level of

consultation skill, above all, has shown remarkable progress. While mentioning that REDD+ secures the sustainability of tropical forests and brings great benefits, Mr. Ma emphasized the construction of more effective policy and incentives and the improvement of capacity with support from donor countries because obtainable benefits are greatly affected by the structure of REDD. Lastly, he hoped that it would be possible to construct a system to pay compensation for other environmental services at the national, regional, and international levels if the payment system of REDD+ is established.

Next, Mr. Zulfira Warta from WWF Indonesia asked if REDD+ would be an effective solution to the forest issue. Indonesia is trying to reduce emissions by 26% through self-supporting efforts while achieving 7% economic growth, with continued efforts for further reduction with the support of other countries and international agencies as the national strategy. Because promoting forest conservation reduces income in areas where logging has progressed, how to balance forest conservation and decreasing income is an important issue. In Indonesia, it is thought that addressing these issues while utilizing REDD would enable the country to reduce emissions and review the domestic system. Referring to the case in Sumatra, Mr. Warta stated that 50% of the forest in the national parks has already vanished and that time is running out for the rest, and appealed for support not only from both outside and inside the conserved area but also from the sub-national and national levels. Because the degree of deforestation varies between Sumatra, Kalimantan, and Papua provinces, considerations for setting the reference emission level and high project costs remain as unresolved issues. He also pointed out the necessity of taking into consideration not only forest conservation and sustainable forest utilization but also the religious and social connections with the forest.

The presentation delivered by Mr. Henry Scheyvens from the Institute for Global Environmental

Strategies (IGES) focused on sustainable communities and good forest governance. In developing countries, participatory forest management has attracted growing attention for nearly 30 years. Because the livelihoods of the poorest in society are provided by the forest, it will certainly affect the promotion of forest conservation favorably if they become aware that forest conservation is far better than deforestation in terms of making a living. For this purpose, efforts are being made to establish forest management by local residents. At the same time, improving governance is vital because weak forest governance and poorly organized financial management adversely affect REDD+. As a specific example, Mr. Scheyvens introduced the case of Papua New Guinea. Forests in Papua New Guinea are mostly owned by indigenous people and used for resources for every aspect of life. Under the present circumstances, unsustainable deforestation is underway because they can only obtain revenue by development, given the absence of support from the government for forest management. In addition, it has become difficult to obtain their consent to cooperate in REDD+ because they have not been given enough benefits from the existing system. Therefore, free, prior informed consent (FPIC), participation in the mapping of land use, and the role and responsibility of a community in REDD+ are increasingly important. Currently, the IGES is explaining this situation and extending its activities in collaboration with NGOs and local communities.

In the question and answer session, it was asserted that, judging from the fact that buyers will seek as low a carbon price as possible, realizing REDD+ is essentially difficult from the point of view of the balance between revenues from REDD+ and revenues from illegal logging and farmland development. In response, Mr. Warta, who had compared the two revenues, stated that there is nothing to be worried about because carbon credit gives more profit.

Responding to a question on what is needed to recover the trust of the community, Mr. Warta stated

that it would be necessary to prevent deforestation and provide incentives besides developing reference emission level and MRV and addressing safeguards simultaneously.

Lastly, Mr. Bigol from Papua New Guinea, who made a presentation on the first day, had a serious question for the attendees, asking them to think if it is possible to make the project a success given the fact that his country has a very limited number of engineers with monitoring technology and this small number of engineers cover a vast area.

#### **Session 4: Panel discussion**

##### **What is necessary to utilize the capability of each player to the maximum extent for the promotion of REDD activities?**

A panel discussion was held following the presentations from the attending countries and agencies. Panelists were Dr. Walker from Winrock International, Ms. Swickard from VCS, Mr. Kao from Cambodia, and Mr. Satoshi Akahori, who is the Director of the Forest Carbon Sink Strategy Office of the Research, Extension and Environment Policy Division of Forestry Agency; the moderator was Mr. Mitsuo Matsumoto from FFPRI. In the panel discussion, questions from the floor were used as a basis for discussion.

Responding to a question on how to evaluate safeguards under the strict payment system, Ms. Swickard stated that they can be evaluated by the original framework that a country constructs for safeguards and monitoring, and that monitoring and reports can verify the achievements. Asked by Director Dr. Matsumoto about the impression of the guidelines of the Bilateral Offset Credit Mechanism, she also asserted that VCS is also considering the same problem and wishes to maintain the same direction in the future.

Mr. Akahori was asked a question on the direction and schedule of technological standards. He stated that COP17 has decided only on the outline of the modality

of the reference level and the information system of safeguards, and that discussions would continue toward COP18. Responding to a question on how to maintain consistency between prompt implementation of REDD+ and international negotiations in a limited time, he said that a voluntary approach instead of an international framework would promote this.

However, in terms of the opinions in developing countries about the progress of international negotiations and the Japanese approach, Mr. Keo pointed out a problem, saying, “Frankly speaking, REDD takes time and needs money, and its process is complicated.” His opinion shows that developing countries are worried about REDD, while holding great expectations. Regarding funding, which is one of the most worrisome issues, he stated that donors are very important in the first stage of funding, in which the private sector plays an important role, and proposed that banks seeking investment opportunities should join the discussion in order to find solutions together.

As an essential issue of REDD+, one attendee asked if economic incentives from REDD are larger than what would normally be expected from a development project. Mr. Busch stated that it is possible to obtain larger economic incentives because REDD is intended not to stop economic activities associated with deforestation but to reduce emissions. In addition, he predicted that REDD would get a better reception in areas unsuitable for oil palm plantations owing to inconvenient location. Agreeing with Mr. Busch’s opinion, Dr. Walker said, “REDD+ is not always the best solution in every area on the earth.” She implied that, if an oil palm plantation is associated with deforestation, not only REDD but also other sectors whose economic activities are impaired by this may become involved.

Japan declared that it would not participate in the Second Commitment Period of the Kyoto Protocol. Concerning the Japanese declaration, an attendee asked if there would be collaboration with Canada and Russia,

which also declared that they would not participate in the Second Commitment Period. Mr. Akahori said, “Cooperation will continue, though it will develop on a voluntary basis.” The Japanese government currently specifies the framework of the Bilateral Offset Credit Mechanism as the core of its measures after 2013. In addition, Mr. Akahori stated that Japanese companies participate in the demonstration activities of REDD voluntarily and provide knowledge obtained in the activities to the government for policy formulation.

### **Closing session**

As a conclusion, Dr. Mitsuo Matsumoto of the REDD Research and Development Center of FFPRI summarized the seminar. Each country and each organization had noticed that the simple structure developed in the past is not sufficient to promote REDD+ and had advanced to the stage of constructing or planning to construct a database that integrates various data collected since the previous seminar. At the same time, he was moved by the sharing among participants of knowledge and experiences based on real-world activities, and outlined the structure of the accounting reporting system for REDD+. Dr. Matsumoto expressed his desire that every participant in this two-day seminar would return to his or her country and further develop activities based on the knowledge obtained here, to enable realization of a future with abundant forests.